This Settlement Agreement ("Agreement") is entered into by and between the New York State Commission on Public Integrity ("Commission") and Pirro-Buley & Associates ("PB&A");

WHEREAS, the Commission is the New York State agency responsible for administering and enforcing Article 1-A of the New York State Legislative Law ("Lobbying Act"); and

WHEREAS, it has been determined that the PB&A failed to timely file its 2005 Lobbyist Statement of Registration and their 2005 January/February, March/April, May/June & July/August Lobbyist Bimonthly Reports on behalf of Forest City Ratner Companies in violation of 1-e, 1-h and 1-o of the Lobbying Act by the New York Temporary State Commission on Lobbying and Pursuant to Executive Law §94 (12)(b) and the Public Employees Reform Act of 2007, §§36, 39, and 40, the New York State Commission on Public Integrity ("Commission") is authorized to complete the unfinished business of the New York Temporary State Commission on Lobbying; and

WHEREAS, In lieu of appearing for a civil penalty hearing for the violation referred to herein, the parties to this Agreement have agreed to resolve their dispute in a manner that avoids further administrative litigation; and

THEREFORE, in consideration of the mutual covenants made, and the final settlement of the alleged violations referred to herein, the parties agree that:

- Within thirty (30) days of the date of this Agreement, PB&A has agreed to pay to I. the Commission a civil penalty in the amount of \$500. If full payment is not received within thirty (30) days of this Agreement, this Agreement shall become null and void in its entirety; and
- II. Notwithstanding the provisions of this Agreement, PB&A understands and acknowledges that the Commission may investigation other violations of the Lobbying Act, if any, by the PB&A; and
- Any amendment or modification to this Agreement shall be in writing and signed III. by both parties.

Dated: October 7,2008

New York State Commission

on Public Integrity

ACCEPTED AND AGREED TO THIS 23 DAY OF Ser

Firm: Pirro-Buley & Associates